Placement of Regional Apparatus Based on Merit in Structural Position Based on System Thinking Approach

Erni Qomariyah a

a Hala Oleo University, Kendari, South East Sulawesi, Indonesia

1. Introduction

From the time of the New Order to the Reform Order the government has issued three Employment Laws, namely: Law No.8/1974, Law No.43/1999 and Law No.5/2014. The contents of these three policies almost have the same goal that is to realize a professional apparatus through a merit-based personnel management. However, the objectives of these three policies are still experiencing various problems, one of which is due to the positional structural placement not merit-based. One of the causes of placement has not been merit-based because of its prone implementation of bureaucratic politicization. This fact is in line with Klingner and Nalbandian (1985) theories that there are dominant values in the administration of public service.

The issuance of Law No. 5/2014 becomes the legal basis for the emergence of Regulation of the Minister of PAN-RB No. 13/2014 on the filling of senior high office through open selection. The emergence of this regulation is the political will of the government to apply the merit principle in organizing the placement of structural officials. Momaha Municipal Administration has already conducted the selection of this position once in the placement of echelon II/b officials. But for the selection of echelon III and IV officials placement still use the legal basis PP No. 100/2000. Under this regulation the function of the Office of Consideration of Position and Duty which is chaired by the Regional Secretary. The placement of structural officials of echelon III and IV is prone to bureaucratic politicization.

2. Theory

To obtain a more complete picture of the condition of the civil service system in the city government Momaha is to describe the implementation of stages of personnel and personnel patterns. The implementation of regional personnel conducted by the Momaha Municipal Government includes: formation, recruitment, placement, education and training, placement of structural officials, payroll and pensions. Meanwhile, the employment pattern is an attempt to explain the employment practices used in the relationship between the central and local government.

There are basically three (3) patterns in the administration of personnel in the government of Momaha Town. First, the stages of the implementation of regional personnel that the implementation process is carried out entirely by the City Government Momaha. Placement of structural officials in the Momaha City administration still holds the problem. The problem occurs because there is a different legal basis used in the placement of structural officials. For appointment of echelon II / b officials using PAN-RB Regulation no. 13/2014 on openly charging the Office of the Leader. As for the placement of Echelon III and IV still use Government Regulation no. 100/2000. In this last rule the role of the Agency for the consideration of position and rank is very dominant. This dominance led to the imposition of Echelon II structural officials under the prone to bureaucratic politicization. Novelty (novelty) of this research is to see the reality of the problem of placement of structural positions by looking at the relationship between the elements with each other with systems thinking approach. This study aims to create a model of organizing the placement of structural positions in the city government Momaha. The results showed that systemically the placement of structural officials based on merit showed two behaviors, namely reinforcing and balancing.
Second, the implementation of regional personnel stages in the implementation process involves the Central Government, Provincial and City Government. Third, the implementation of regional personnel stages determined by the Central Government, while the City Government is only as executor. Furthermore, the regional personnel system in Momawe City government will be discussed and analyzed using the theory of local government personnel system from United Nations (1966).

a) Forming Formation

In preparing the formation of the regional apparatus, the considerations are Article 47 and Article 56 of the ASN Law no. 5 Year 2014. Namely that the State Personnel Board (BKN) has a function of management of civil state apparatus in the field of technical considerations of formation, procurement, inter-agency movement, approval promotion, pension. Furthermore, in the explanation of Article 56 Paragraph (3), that every government institution is obliged to compile needs of number and type of civil servant position based on job analysis and workload analysis.

b) Recruitment

Procurement of candidates for regional civil servants in the Momawe city administration in 2004-2104 originated from several sources, among others: honorary laborer Katagori I (K I), honorary staff of Katagori II (K II) and general applicants. For stages of procurement from general applicants still refer to the old regulation that is PP. 98/2000 juncto PP no. 11/2002 on Procurement of Civil Servants. This procurement starts from planning, announcement, application, screening, appointment of CPNS up to the appointment of civil servants. According to Head of Procurement Planning Division, that:

"After the approval from the Minister related to the formation and details of his position and educational qualifications, after that we announced in the print media in Momawe City for 14 days. After that the applicant can register online, then the registration number will appear to be deposited into BKD with other files required."

c) Placement of Government Employee

Employee placement is an integral process with the procurement of employees. After the recruitment process, newly-received employees must be placed in a specific organizational unit that requires new personnel and refers to existing formations. One of the factors to be considered in employee placement is the educational background. The educational background that an employee possesses during his/ her previous education should be considered, especially in the process of placing the employee to complete the job assignment, as well as assuming authority and responsibility. The relationship of educational background to the placement of human resources can not be separated, in addition one's educational background can also be a reference of the workload and responsibilities seen from the achievement of the value obtained during the school.

d) Education and Training

The purpose of education and training is to realize the regional apparatus that has the competence in accordance with the requirements of office. There are several types of education and training, such as:

- Pre-service training and education; and
- In-service training and education.

3. Research Method

This study uses systems thinking approach that offers a new way based on the relevance of all elements (Maani and Cavana, 2000:2). In system thinking approach there are two choice of method, that is hard system and soft system. This research uses hard system method. In the hard system one of the methods is known as dynamic system (Senge, 1994). While the data analysis using analysis Coyle (1996) which is one tool of the method of dynamic systems (dynamic systems).

The use of dynamic system methods based on the five-stage approach of Coyle. The five-step approach from Coyle (1996), namely: a) Problem Recognition; b) Problem Understanding and System Description (influence diagram); c) Qualitative Analysis (bright ideas or pet theories), d) Qualitative Analysis (bright ideas or pet theories), d) Qualitative Analysis (bright ideas or pet theories), d) Qualitative Analysis (bright ideas or pet theories), e) Policy Testing and Design.

The location of this research is done in the government of Momawe City of Southeast Sulawesi Province, with the consideration that it is still difficult to implement the implementation of structural positioning based on merit (Utha, 2015:32). Instruments used in addition to the researchers themselves, interviews, and observations. Furthermore, after understood the problem in the placement of structural officials, then compiled causal loop diagram (CLD). The model is then modeled by considering the balancing (B) and reinforcing (R) patterns to determine the behavior over time of the structural position placement in Momawe Town government.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Results

After the existence of this ASN Act there is a very basic difference in the filling of the Primary office leadership that is echelon II compared to the time still using the Law No.43 of 1999. Previously, the base of civil servant appointment in structural positions is regulated in the provisions of the implementation of PP. 100/ 2000 juncto PP no. 13/ 2002, that the duty of the City's position and consideration agency has the duty of giving consideration to the Regional Personnel Officer in appointment, transfer and dismissal in and from the echelon II downward structural positions. After the Act of ASN, the basis used for the filling of Senior High Officials or echelon II based on Regulation of the Minister of PAN-RB No. 13 Year 2014 now known as “office auction”.

This is in line with the results of interviews with the Head of Regional Education and Training Agency of Momawe City that:
"In the past, to appoint the Regional Secretary was enough the Regional Officer of the Civil Service. Similarly to appoint the Head of Service. But now it is different, with the State Civil Apparatus Law we have to follow the new regulations ".

Momaha City Government for selection of echelon IIb position has been dilpilment as much as one (1) time, that is to fill vacancy Head of Health Department previously occupied by dr. MR who enters retirement. Similarly, the vacant position of the Head of the Regional Financial and Asset Management Board abandoned by FF, SE, MM, because it also entered the retirement age. This refers to the PP Minister of PAN-RB. 13 of 2014 on Procedures for Filling Highly Open Leadership in Government Institutions.

Furthermore the procedure for the formation of selection committee for "office auction" is explained by the Head of Employee Development Agency Employment Agency Education and Training of Momaha Municipal Government that:

"KDP formed a selection committee consisting of 5 people, namely: Regional Secretary as chairman of the selection committee, Head of BKD as secretary. While from academicians as much as two (2) people namely Dr. Ns from Halu Oleo University and Dr. Ir. JT from the University of Southeast Sulawesi. As for the professional from the former Regional Secretary of Momaha City is KH ".

As for the appointment of echelon III and IV officials is fully done by the Regional Personnel Officers with reference to the Government Regulation No.100 of 2000 juncto PP No.13 of 2002 that the task of Baperjakat Kota has the task of giving consideration to the PPKD in the appointment, transfer and dismissal in and from the structural positions of echelon II downward.

The placement of structural officials in Momaha City Government is determined based on Baperjakat consideration. Baperjakat considerations are generally based on seniority in the rank of money represented in the Arrangement List. Even if there is testing or test promotion of employees, but in general seniority/ rank remains one of the decisive factors. In the appointment of echelon II/ b officials, the appraisal of the appointment of strategic positions through the accredited agency accreditation center is the State Administration (LAN) of Makassar.

The latest study results from Utha (2015:315) illustrate that merit system is difficult to enforce in civil servant positioning in structural positions in Momaha City during 2008 – 2011. The latest data from BKPPD Kota Momaha also strengthen the study results from Utha. This can be seen from some echelon IIb officials not in accordance with the area of expertise and required in his position.

For echelon officials within the scope of the Momaha Municipal Government until October 2016 were recorded as follows: echelon II/ b, male (26) and female (8), echelon III/ a, male (46) and female (13) echelon III/ b, male (68) and female (32), echelon IV/ a, male (295) and female (163) and echelon IV/ b, male (161) and female (185). From the data it can be seen that echelon II/ b officials until echelon IV/ a officials are dominated by men, whereas echelon IV/ b officials are dominated by women.

There is something interesting to note in regard to the placement of echelon II/ b officials within the scope of the Momaha Municipal Government. Of the 14 echelon II/ b officials have not fulfilled the requirements as regulated in Article 7 PP No.100/ 2000. Whereas the civil servant who was appointed in the structural position has not followed and passed the Diklatpim in accordance with the level of structural positions shall follow and pass Diklatpim not later than 12 months since the concerned is inaugurated. Furthermore, the placement of echelon II/ b officials is also not in accordance with the Regulation of LAN Chief No.11/ 2013 on Diklatpim II which is a prerequisite for occupying the echelon II structural positions. Because there are 14 officials who have not attended Diklatpim II, whereas the official has been inaugurated for more than one year.

The role of the Regional Officers of Regional Officer can be seen Inauguration of echelon II-IV officials in Momaha City Government since 2011 - 2016 has been done 40 times with the number of officers inaugurated as many as 3,487 people. Frequent inauguration of officials is possible because based on the provisions of the implementation of PP. 100/ 2000 juncto PP no. 13/2002, that the duty of Baperjakat Kota has the duty to give consideration to KDP in the appointment, dismissal, and dismissal in and from the structural positions of echelon II downwards. Though actually borrowing the term Thoaha (2014:61) Baperjakat actually "political instruments" relic of the New Order is precisely the dominant in determining the promotion of someone.

In addition, the political temperature in Momaha City is heating up ahead of the mayoral elections held on February 15, 2017. This is marked by the occurrence of a bomb explosion at the home of Mayor Momaha www.detik.com. The 'heat' of the political temperature in Momaha Town occurred because after the incumbent served two (2) periods, then submitted his son as one of the candidates of Momaha Mayor.

Major role of Mayor as Officer of Regional Personnel is very visible on the placement of structural officials before and after the mayoral election held on February 15, 2017. For example, one (1) month before the pilwali there are two (2) inauguration done. The first is the inauguration of the principal of twenty four (24) people (Kasman, 2017). And secondly, two (2) weeks before the Pilwillop is executed, the Momaha City Officers Officer inaugurates the Task Force (Plt) Head of Agency and Head of Agency at the level of senior high officials and echelon III and IV officials of 956 persons. This refers to the Decree of Mayor of Kendari on January 26, 2017 Number 164 Year 2017, about the inauguration of structural officials of echelon III and echelon IV (Kasman, 2017).

After one month as the Executing Officer (TT) or two weeks after the election of the regional head, the Head of the Agency and the Head of the Agency at the level of the Primary High Officer the scope of the Momaei Municipal Government was finally delegated based on the Mayor's Decree No. Momaha. 373 Year
2017 was recorded 67 people inaugurated and mutated, which is 49 officials inaugurated and 18 others dinonjob. Some prominent positions are shifted namely, Head of Education Office of Youth and Sports who is now an Expert Staff in the Field of Community. Head of BKD also shifted as Assistant General Administration. The seven (7) Echelon II Officers Non-Job, among others: Plt. Administrative Assistant, Plt. Expert Staff for Government Sector, Plt. Head of Library Service, Plt. Head of Population Control and Family Planning, Plt. Head of Satpol PP, Plt. Expert Staff for Economy and Plt. Dinas Penanaman Modal and PTSP, www.kendaripos.co.id.

Not only echelon II, III and IV officers were inaugurated and transferred, the headmaster of Momah City was also affected post-election. Two months after the pilwali of 73 appointed lecturers, consisting of 67 Heads of Kindergarten (TK), Primary and Secondary School (SMP), 1 overseer and 5 School Supervisors inaugurated by Decree (SK) Mayor No. 507 Year 2017 (Fajrin, 2017).

One of the officials of the Municipal Education and Training Agency (BKPPD) of the Momah Municipal Government said that:

"That's what the incumbent donor volunteers donest to if they play on two legs. Supports incumbent sons and supports other candidate pairs. Hence the January inauguration was why Echelon II in Pilkan, in fact they were also 'hung' position. If work to win his son incumbent congratulations jabatanya with the inauguration of the next month to diperefinifyakan.
But if caught "betrayed" yes nonjob."

In addition to the politicization of the bureaucracy, there are other interesting things to be observed related to the role of Regional Government Officer of Momah Government Officer in the placement of Echelon II officials. Based on the recapitulation of Echelon II officials in the scope of Momah Municipal Government it can be seen that Echelon II officials are dominated by the same ethnic as the Regional Personnel Development Officer. That is, from thirteen (13) Heads of Service, nine (9) of them are from ethnic T, and of twelve (12) Heads of Office, seven (7) are of ethnic T, the rest are dominated by the same ethnic as the Deputy Regional Leaders ie ethnic Bs.

Given the phenomenon of ethnocentrism, promodialism or 'son of the region', there is a misunderstanding that the placement of structural officials must be filled by certain people and certain tribes. An empirical fact, that the spirit of ethnocentrism, promodialism or 'son of the region' becomes a basic consideration in the current structural positioning system. Furthermore, according to Kambo that this phenomenon if not well managed in the implementation of regional personnel, it is not impossible ethnocentrism and promodialism will be a new means of legitimacy to "attack other parties or even kill the careers of other people's employees" (Kambo, 2015).

First, the placement mechanism can be divided into two (2) types, namely the placement mechanism for echelon II/ b officials and the placement for echelon III and IV officials. For the placement of echelon III and IV officials the mechanisms are as follows: (i) for echelon IV/ b promotion, staff must lead to a minimum requirement of IIIa, (ii) for echelon IV/ a rank of at least III/ a or echelon IV/ the same as other echelons. It could be directly promoted to echelon IV/ a if in the agency or body there is no echelon IV/ b, (iii) for promotion of echelon III/ b must come from echelon IV/ a and can not jump from IV/ b with rank minimum III/ c, (iv) for echelon III/ a promotion must come from echelon III/ b with a minimum rank III/ d. All by showing good performance and based on the rank order and length of service. However, according to the Head of Employee Development said that "of course also all returned to the team Baperjakat to assess who can be appointed to occupy the echelon III and IV".

As for the mechanism of placement for echelon II/ b officials in Momah Municipal Government has been done as much as one (1) time based on Regulation of Minister of PAN-RB. 13 Year 2014 now known as "office auction". This selection was first used for the selection of Head of Health Office and Head of Education Office of Youth and Sports who is now an Expert Staff in the Field of Community.

Regional Financial and Asset Management Agency. The mechanism in Momah City is as follows: First, Preparation consists of: (i) Formation of selection committee, (ii) Selection committee is 5 (five) people with internal 2 (two) people and external 3 (three) persons, (iv) the selection committee is assisted by the assessment team of the competence (assessor) of the Maharani Aksum, (v) the preparation and stipulation of the vacant job competency.

Second, the Implementation consists of: (i) announcement of vacancy, (ii) administrative selection, (iii) competence selection (managerial competence and field competence, (iv) final interview, (v) candidate tracking (vi) (vii) health and psychological testing, (viii) financing at DIPA Third, Monitoring and Evaluation consists of: (i) eligible and inaugurated candidates are given orientation for 1 (one) month, (ii) KDP submit a report to the KASN to the Minister of PAN-RB and the Minister of Home Affairs.

Furthermore from the above mechanism can be seen that for the criteria of appraisal placement of the most important echelon III and IV officials are Team Balance Board and Position Board (Baperjakat) consisting of: (i) Secretary of the region as chairman, (ii) Head of BKPPD as secretary, (iii) Assistant I in charge (iv) Assistant III in charge of Government as member, (iv) Regional Inspectorate. This is based on PP No.100 Year 2000 jo PP No.13 of 2002 on the Appointment of Civil Servants in Structural Position.

As for the criteria for appraising the placement of echelon II officials/ b seen from two (2) types of field competence and managerial competence. For field competencies assessed by the selection committee. The selection committee was formed by the Regional Government Officer of Momah Government Officer. Members of the Regional Secretary (Head), Head of BKPPD (as secretary), KH, former Regional Secretary (member of the community) as a member, Academician 2 (two) from Halu Oleo University (Dr. Ns) and Southeast Sulawesi University (Dr. JT). While for echelon assessment criteria in managerial competence
assessed by the accredited body that is the State Administration Institute (LAN) Makassar.

While the implementation of structural positioning based on merit can be described as follows. For the placement of echelon III and IV positions are still subjected to subjectivity. In 2012 there are a number of placements as many as 556 (five hundred fifty-six) people. And after the Mayor Elections as many as 594 (five hundred and ninety-four) of the apparatus of the region are inaugurated. So also when in 2016 before the Mayor Election there were a number of 392 (three hundred and ninety-two) echelon officials placed.

While in 2017 there are promotions and mutations of seven (7) times. Three (3) prior to Mayor Elections and four (4) times post pilwali. Two weeks before the election there was a 956 (nine hundred and fifty-six) structural office assignment which was the inauguration of the echelon II, III and IV officials. According to Mayor Momhae "throughout my tenure for about 10 years, this is the most official inauguration". Because too many officials are inaugurated until it is held in Momhae Town Park, whereas it is usually enough to be held in the Hall of Defense or Momhae City Government Pattern Room.

Systemically it can be explained that the dynamic behavior of structural positioning based on merit plays an increasing trend (reinforcing). The development of a good merit-based position placement is characterized by merit-based recruitment through open selection for Primary Chairs or better known as echelon II. With the publication of this new regulation, many parties are involved. Among the State Administration Institutions in the assessment of competence and the State Civil Apparatus Commission as an institution that oversees the selection of this position based merit. The number of parties involved in the selection of this position indicates the political will of the central government to improve the organization of these structural positions.

However, this merit-based position placement can not be applied in structural positions for echelon III and IV because there are no new regulations governing open selection. Similarly, there are issues that the newly elected Heads of Offices and Heads of Bodies based on job selection will be replaced. The influence of the values of personnel administration reduces the placement of structural positions based on merit. The decline in the placement of structural positions based on merit because of the influence of the Regional Government is so dominant to make the bureaucracy as an effective political machine to win the couples it supports. This is marked by an increase in the politicization of bureaucracy when the moment of elections conducted by the Regional Government, which has a role to determine echelon II, III and echelon IV officials. Moreover, Mayor Momhae after completing his duty will fight in the upcoming Governor election.

This merit-based structural positioning that is influenced by value laden practices does not fulfill the principles of the civil service system because it is still colored by political considerations and kinship. One of the principles is the fulfillment of the placement of structural positions through a merit-based mechanism. Unmet fulfillment of merit-based organization in this stage will affect the implementation of regional personnel management stages characterized by spoil system and nepotism. This recurring incident will bring back new policies to minimize the occurrence of non-transparency in its implementation.

The systemic structure of the employment subsystem based on merit can be seen in the following figure:

Figure 1. The systemic structure of the employment subsystem based on merit
Source: Analytical result, 2017

Related to the vulnerability of bureaucratic politicization in the placement of structural positions can be observed based on interviews with one of the important officials of Momhae City Government, that:

"The appointed official must support the vision of the Regional Head's mission. If at the moment of the election must support candidates in the stretcher Mayor. Because if there are structural officials who "play two legs" or support two candidate pairs of mayors, it will be mutated or dinonjobkan. Or even the "silence" of structural officials in the sense of not working to influence others in support of the Mayor-backed candidate, it is certain that the official will be transferred to a "dry" place or no longer given office”.

According to McCourt (2007:2), merit system can be define as the oppoint of the best person for any given job. That is, the position must be filled by the best people because of the quality and ability, not because of non merit factors or other ascertain factors such as politics, family, friends, tribe, religion, ethnicity, area, social class, gender, wealth.

McCourt’s point is to emphasize that the application of a merit system in the appointment or placement of officials, from the top to the bottom level must be carried out competitively based on clear and understandable merit-based rules. However Klingner and Nalbandian (1985:9) view public administration administration as a value-laden process. Therefore an alternative approach is needed in looking at it from the point of view of political interaction and administration. These values include political considerations and local wisdom should be considered in the bridge of structural positions.

As in the scope of the Momhae Municipal Government, the pattern of kinship in structural positions is still very strong. This can be seen from some echelon II/ b officials occupied by relatives of the Mayor. This is reinforced by the statement of one
official who is the result of the selection of positions for Echelon II/b positions, that:

"I was visited by his sister Mayor, that I will be replaced as Kadis. Although in fact my rules can only be changed after taking office for two years based on the results of the selection of positions. The reason I changed for less my deposit up (Mayor-researcher). Yet all this time that governs my financial problems, although I as the Head of Service. But the secretary of the service who will replace me, who is also his sister is empty one ".

Looking at the facts above we can see Stahl's statement in Priyanto (2013:40-41) says that:

The entrance and usually the promotion features of a merit system are ordinarily founded on a plan of open, competitive examination (not necessarily written tests) by which candidates are appraised as to their relative fitness for duty in a position, an occupation, or a service.

From these explanations, shows that placement is one important aspect in the employment system whose requirements must be merit-based. Because the merit system means eliminating the practice of spoils system. The position and career of civil servants should not be mixed with political appointee positions filled based on political patronage considerations, civil servant positions should not be occupied by a political appointment, otherwise political appointed positions should not be filled by civil servants.

When seen in article 108 of Law no. Presidential Decree No. 5 Year 2014 on State Civil Apparatus affirms that the filling of senior high leadership positions is conducted openly and competitively among the regional apparatus, conducted in an open and competitive manner at the national or inter-city/ city level within a province. Based on several key policy issues set forth in the ASN Act, there are several key areas of focus, including the protection of bureaucrats from political interference. The commitment of neutrality of the regional apparatus when faced with a side alignment dilemma in a local election can be protected by the State Civil Apparatus Act. However, from the above table can be seen before and after the election, officials in the region are not calmly worried about being transferred to positions that are less strategic even in non jobs (not given office). This is also evident in Momaha Town government, so there is no guarantee of career certainty for the local apparatus as it is stuck on political pressure.

Referring to the above description, it can be concluded that the tendency of dynamic behavior based positioning based merit placement patterned exponential growth. This tendency indicates that the dynamic behavior of the merit-based position placement has the intention to reach the goal explicitly, namely the election of qualified and competent officials according to their position. This shows the political will of the central and local governments to place their officials according to their competence. This is based on the Minister of PAN–RB Regulation no. 13 of 2014 and the Momaha City Government has implemented the regulation to elect echelon II/b.

The dynamics of the placement of structural positions is influenced by the values of public administration kepegawain the political response. These values can be seen from the role of local government officials who have a significant influence on the implementation of structural positioning based on merit. The more dominant the Regional Government influences the holding of structural positions, the less the merit of placement of structural positions.

5. Conclusion

When viewed according to Law Number. 5 Year 2014 on the State Civil Apparatus asserts, the filling of high leadership positions pratama carried out openly and competitively among the regional apparatus. This is also reinforced in PP No.13/2014 on the selection of positions for Senior High Leadership. This is where the role of regional head as a political official reduced its dominance. Because so far the placement of Echelon II, III and IV of appointment, transfer and dismissal is the authority of the Regional Position Judgment Board. But in practice the role of Mayor as Staff Officer Personnel is still very dominant, because for the placement of Echelon III and IV is entirely the authority of the Staffing Officer.

Based on some of the key policy issues above, there are some key points of focus, including protecting bureaucrats from political interference. The commitment of the neutrality of the regional apparatus when faced with the side alignment dilemma in a regional head election to be protected by UU Law. For this reason, it is necessary for the policy of the Central Government to regulate the placement of Echelon III and IV officials, not just Echelon II. Because Echelon III and IV officials are much more than Echelon II, in addition they are directly related to the service to the community.

References


